

THE LATIN MANUSCRIPTS OF ALFONSO DE ESPINA'S  
*FORTALITIUM FIDEI*\*

LOS MANUSCRITOS LATINOS DEL FORTALITIUM FIDEI  
DE ALFONSO DE ESPINA

GUILLEM GAVALDÀ MESTRES  
Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona  
<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5986-6867/>

*Abstract:* Although Alfonso de Espina's *Fortalitium fidei*, one of the most prominent Latin treatises of religious polemics of fifteenth century Europe, has received much attention from the academic community, only a few scholars have ventured to investigate its manuscript production and circulation. As a result of this, no reliable handlist of the extant Latin manuscripts of the *Fortalitium fidei* was available until now. This article provides the first critical study of the transmission of the work describing the six complete manuscript witnesses as well as nine excerpts of the text, most of which were unknown until now. In doing so, it also corrects incorrect attributions and establishes a list of lost manuscripts. The article thus offers a solid basis for a future edition of the *Fortalitium fidei* and for the study of its reception across premodern Europe.

*Keywords:* codicology; *Fortalitium fidei*; Alfonso de Espina; manuscripts; medieval theology.

*Resumen:* Aunque el *Fortalitium fidei* de Alfonso de Espina, uno de los tratados latinos de polémica religiosa más destacados de la Europa del siglo XV, ha recibido mucha atención por parte de la comunidad académica, sólo unos pocos estudiosos se han aventurado a investigar su producción y circulación manuscrita. Por ello, hasta ahora no se disponía de una lista fiable de los manuscritos latinos existentes del *Fortalitium fidei*. Este artículo ofrece el primer estudio crítico de la transmisión de la obra, describiendo los seis testigos manuscritos completos, así como nueve fragmentos del texto, la mayoría de los cuales eran desconocidos hasta ahora. Al hacerlo, también corrige atribuciones erróneas y establece una lista de manuscritos perdidos. El artículo ofrece así una base sólida para una futura edición del *Fortalitium fidei* y para el estudio de su recepción en toda la Europa premoderna.

*Palabras clave:* codicología; *Fortalitium fidei*; Alfonso de Espina; manuscritos; teología medieval.

---

\* This study was undertaken thanks to a scholarship FPI 2021 (PRE2021-101106) granted by the Ministerio de Ciencia e Innovación as part of the Project "The Latin Talmud: Edition and Study of the Dossier" (MICINN, PID2020-112592GB-I00) and in connection with the Research Group of the Generalitat de Catalunya "Islamolatina. Intercultural Dimensions of Medieval and Modern Thought" (SGR 00152) at the Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona.

## SUMARIO

1. Introduction.– 2. Description of the complete extant Latin manuscripts of the *Fortalitiū fidei*.– 2.1. Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 156-157.– 2.2. Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 7497.– 2.3. Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 9524.– 2.4. Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS II 83.– 2.5. El Burgo de Osma, Catedral de la Asunción del Burgo de Osma MS 154.– 2.6. Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque de l'Agglomération du Pays de Saint-Omer MS 144.– 3. Description of the Latin *excerpta* of the *Fortalitiū fidei*.– 3.1. Augsburg, Staats- und Stadtbibliothek Augsburg. MS 8 Cod 203 (ff. 39v-51v).– 3.2. Darmstadt, Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek Darmstadt. MS 146 (f. 218r-v).– 3.3. Groningen, Universiteitsbibliotheek. MS 103 (f. 19r-v).– 3.4. München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek MS Clm 14081 (ff. 89v-91v).– 3.5. München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek MS Clm 22371 (ff. 1r-13v).– 3.6. San Marino (CA), The Huntington Library MS HM 1068 (f. I).– 3.7. Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek. MS 4043 (ff. 108r-145v).– 3.8. Wrocław, Biblioteka Uniwersytecka. MS I Q 73 a (ff. 124r-146v).– 3.9. Würzburg, Universitätsbibliothek MS M.ch.q.156 (ff. 65r-68r).– 4. A List of the lost Latin manuscripts of the *Fortalitiū fidei*.– 5. Some observations on the transmission of the *Fortalitiū fidei*.– 5.1. The two branches of the textual tradition.– 5.2. Further connections between the manuscripts.– 6. Preliminary conclusions.– 7. Cited bibliography.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The Latin manuscript production of the *Fortalitiū fidei*, a famous treatise on religious controversy written by the Castilian Franciscan Alfonso de Espina in Valladolid between 1458-1460, has not been the subject of detailed studies until now. The book, which was sponsored by the Castilian monarch Henry IV and became a precedent for the inquisitorial programme of the Catholic monarchs, captured the attention of the main European printing workshops<sup>1</sup> and even aroused the curiosity of certain translators, who ren-

---

<sup>1</sup> Seven known editions of the *Fortalitiū fidei* were printed in the main European workshops. These are: Strasburg (Johannes Mentelin) [ante 1472], Basel (Bernard Richel) [1475], Nürnberg (Anton Koberger) [1485], Lyon (Guillaume Balsarin) [1487], Nürnberg (Anton Koberger) [1494], Lyon (Étienne Gueynard) [1511], Lyon (Étienne Gueynard) [1525]. Despite the existence of many publishing workshops in the Iberian Peninsula, it seems that none of them produced any edition of the *Fortalitiū fidei*. Echevarría (2021, pp. 163-166), indicates that Juan Arias Dávila, bishop of Segovia and a very important patron of the Castilian printing workshops, could have had something to do with this striking absence. The enmity between Juan Arias Dávila and Alfonso de Espina was very notable at the Castilian court (even to the extent that the former was held responsible for the death of the author). However, more evidence is needed to substantiate this claim. The only certain data we have is that Iberian booksellers relied on foreign editions to promote the *Fortalitiū fidei*. About medieval printing workshops in the Iberian Peninsula, cf. Martín Abad 2003, pp. 105-113; Reyes Gómez 2005, pp. 123-148.

dered it into various vernacular languages<sup>2</sup>. However, despite its generally acknowledged importance<sup>3</sup>, no one has yet attempted to survey, and even less so to systematize, the extant Latin codicological material. The only codicological study was provided by Fifield<sup>4</sup>, who addressed the rich tradition of French *codices* of the *Fortalitium fidei* and acknowledged the need to inquire into the production of this book, describing and defining the potential reception contexts of the nine French manuscripts known so far – data that must be updated due to the discovery of a tenth French manuscript kept in the Koninklijke Bibliotheek in The Hague.

As a consequence, we face a genuine problem in the cataloguing of the Latin manuscripts of the *Fortalitium fidei* because, even though it was a highly appreciated manual at episcopal and palatine courts of the time, only little is known of its production and tradition. The only two modern attempts to catalogue the Latin manuscript tradition are, in fact, misleading. I refer, in particular, to the widely cited catalogues of Reinhardt, Santiago-Otero<sup>5</sup> and Thomas, *et al.*<sup>6</sup>, which have caused certain confusion in a large part of subsequent scholarship due to their inappropriate systematization, their inaccuracies and errata. To fill this lacuna, I will offer a philological discussion presenting several Latin manuscripts that I have been able to identify<sup>7</sup>. Thus,

---

<sup>2</sup> We have textual witnesses that confirm that the *Fortalitium fidei* was translated at least into French, German and Italian. The most studied tradition of vernacular manuscripts is the French one; this translation apparently goes back to Pierre Richard, while the copies of the manuscripts were commissioned, for the most part, by Louis de Gruuthuse. There are nine manuscripts identified in Fifield 1972, pp. 98-111, which are: Bern, Burgerbibliothek, MS 84; London, British Museum, MS Royal 19 E iv; London, British Museum, MS Royal 17 F vi, vii; Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Fonds français, MS 20067-69; Bruxelles, Bibliothèque royale, MS 9007; Valenciennes, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 244; Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, MS 2535; Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, MS 2536; and Douai, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 515. This list must be completed with a tenth manuscript: Den Haag, Koninklijke Bibliotheek, MS 133 A 6, some of whose miniatures can be found in New York, Brooklyn Museum: 11506-11507. The German tradition has received less scholarly attention. As far as we know to this day, two *excerpta* have been preserved: Hannover, Niedersächsische Landesbibliothek, MS XI 667; and Stuttgart, Württembergische Landesbibliothek, MS HB I. Finally, there was an Italian edition that was prepared in Carmagnola in 1522, now lost.

<sup>3</sup> Over the last decades, several scholars have contributed to describe the central position of the *Fortalitium fidei* in fifteenth-century religious polemics. Some of the most notable investigations are: Netanyahu 1976, pp. 107-165; McMichael 1994, pp. 1-36; Meyuhas Ginio 1995, pp. 145-174; Vidal Doval 2013, pp. 67-86; Cavallero 2018, pp. 121-138; Monsalvo Antón 2020, pp. 225-244; Echevarría 2021, pp. 161-195.

<sup>4</sup> Fifield 1972, pp. 98-111.

<sup>5</sup> Reinhardt, Santiago-Otero 1986, pp. 63-64.

<sup>6</sup> Thomas, *et al.* 2013, p. 454.

<sup>7</sup> The analysis of the manuscripts, which I have all examined in digital copies, would have been impossible without the kind support of the following librarians and scholars: Ulrike Theisen, curator of the Abteilung Archäologie, Kulturhistorisches Museum Magdeburg; Lisa Caprino, Reader Services Coordinator, The Huntington Library; Roos Depla, Bibliothecaris van

I will show that a total number of no less than 21 Latin manuscripts of the *Fortalitium fidei* is known to date, among which there are:

– 6 complete manuscripts: Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 156-157; Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 7497; Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 9524; Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS II 83; El Burgo de Osma, Catedral de la Asunción del Burgo de Osma MS 154; Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque de l'Agglomération du Pays de Saint-Omer MS 144<sup>8</sup>.

– 9 *excerpta*: Augsburg, Staats- und Stadtbibliothek Augsburg MS 8 Cod 203 (ff. 39v-51v); Darmstadt, Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek Darmstadt MS Hs 146 (f. 218r-v); Groningen, Universiteitsbibliotheek MS 103 (f. 19r-v); München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek MS Clm 14081 (ff. 89v-91v); München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek MS Clm 22371 (ff. 1r-13v); San Marino (CA), The Huntington Library MS HM 1068 (f. I); Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek MS 4043 (ff. 108r-145v); Wrocław, Biblioteka Uniwersytecka MS I Q 73 a (ff. 124r-146v); Würzburg, Universitätsbibliothek MS M.ch.q.156 (ff. 65r-68r)<sup>9</sup>.

– And 6 lost manuscripts: El Escorial, Real Biblioteca de San Lorenzo del Escorial MS I. E. 18; Magdeburg, Ökumenisches Domgymnasium Magdeburg MS 228; Pontigny, Abbaye Cistercienne de Pontigny MS 155; a manuscript from Ghent without shelfmark; a manuscript from Rooklooster without shelfmark; and a manuscript from Valladolid without shelfmark.

---

de manuscript dienst, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België; Rémy Cordonnier, head of ancient collections, Bibliothèque de l'Agglomération du Pays de Saint-Omer; Friedrich Simader, Sammlung von Handschriften und alten Drucken, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek; Adrie van der Laan, curator of Special Collections, Groningen Universiteitsbibliotheek; Susan Kleine, Historische Sammlungen, Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek Darmstadt; Łukasz Krzyszczyk, Oddział Rękopisów, Uniwersytet Wrocławski; Luisa Schrauth, Abteilung Handschriften und Alte Drucke, Würzburg, Universitätsbibliothek; Karl-Georg Pfändtner, head of the Staats- und Stadtbibliothek, Augsburg; Juliane Trede, Abteilung Handschriften und Alte Drucke, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek; Berthold Kreß, deputy head of the Stadtbibliothek Augsburg; Nathaniel de Gala, Reader Services Coordinator, The Huntington Library. Special thanks go to Javier de Prado, PhD student, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, who helped me find the reference of the *excerptum*: Wrocław, Biblioteka Uniwersytecka MS I Q 73 a (ff. 124r-146v). I also want to thank Sandra Cano, PhD student, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, who guided me with the *in-situ* consultation of the manuscript: Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 9524.

<sup>8</sup> From now on, these manuscripts will be referred to in the notes as: Bruxelles MS 156-157; Bruxelles MS 7497; Bruxelles MS 9524; Bruxelles MS II 83; El Burgo de Osma MS 154; Saint-Omer MS 144.

<sup>9</sup> From now on, these *excerpta* will be referred in the notes as: Augsburg MS 8 Cod 203; Darmstadt MS 146; Groningen MS 103; München MS Clm 14081; München MS Clm 22371; San Marino (CA) MS HM 1068; Wien MS 4043; Wrocław MS I Q 73 a; Würzburg MS M.ch.q.156.

## 2. DESCRIPTION OF THE COMPLETE EXTANT LATIN MANUSCRIPTS OF THE *FORTALITIUM FIDEI*

At present, six complete Latin manuscripts of the *Fortalitium fidei* are known. Chronologically they all belong to the fifteenth century and are kept in several European libraries in Belgium (4), France (1) and Spain (1). In what follows, I provide a codicological description of each of them:

### 2.1. Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 156-157

This manuscript is very succinctly described in Van den Gheyn<sup>10</sup>; it also appears in the catalogue Thomas, *et al.*<sup>11</sup>. It is a modest codex with big coloured initials at the beginning of every book. At the end of the text of the *Fortalitium fidei*, this codex includes a note with the tenth consideration of book III. This manuscript shares some similarities with Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS II 83 and Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 9524.

Material description: paper; 176 ff.; 385 mm x 278 mm; 2 columns; irregular lines (55-63); gothic hybrid. Initials: big decorated initials (ff. 1r, 2r, 30r, 47v, 110r, 158v, 170v) and also smaller initials, which are all completed. There are no illuminations.

(1r-1v) Prohemium. Incipit: “Turris fortitudinis a facie inimici. Tu es Domine Deus meus qui facis magna et inscrutabilia et mirabilia. quorum non est numerus”; explicit: “bellum Sarracenorum et Christianorum deseruit quarto, a demones uero ab angelis prostrati deseruiunt quinto libro”; (2r-30r) Lib I. Incipit: “Vt detur ordo in presenti libro, quinque erunt principales libri quasi quinque turres Fortalicii fidei inexpugnabiles”; explicit: “cui honor laus benedictio et gloria sine fine amen. Sequitur liber secundus qui est de bello hereticorum contra nostre fidei Fortalicium”; (30r-47r) Lib II. Incipit: “Antiquorum in libris legimus gentilium milites humanam uenerantes gloriam generose diuersa monstrorum genera destrux-

---

<sup>10</sup> The Van den Gheyn catalogue, which contains the four Bruxelles manuscripts, is generally accurate, despite being succinct. The catalogue distinguishes the different sections of the manuscript with their corresponding foliation, without, however, specifying the *incipit* or *explicit* of each section nor the foliation of each book of the *Fortalitium fidei*. It also offers a material and chronological description (material, foliation, dimensions, century, columns, initials, signatures, stamps, binding and label, if any). I will describe the hits and misses of this catalogue as I present each manuscript. In the case of this codex, the catalogue does not indicate the number of columns, the script nor the information on the decorated initials. Regarding the historical description, the provenance of the manuscript is not reported. See: Van den Gheyn 1903, pp. 508-509.

<sup>11</sup> Thomas, *et al.* 2013, p. 454.

isse”; explicit: “Domini nostri Ihesus Christi cui est honor et gloria in secula seculorum. Amen. Sequitur liber tercius”; (47v-109v) Lib III. Incipit: “Hereticorum bello quasi periculosiori soluto, cum sit a familiaribus inimicis latenter commissum”; explicit: “Cuius singulari presidio fides christianorum inuiolabilis sine fine perseueret. Amen. Explicit liber tercius sequitur quartus”; (110r-158r) Lib IV. Incipit: “Incipit liber quartus de sarracenorum bello. Viriliter ut deus tradidit dissoluto iam experiri oportet in hoc libro quarto saracenorum uires”; explicit: “qui est turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, cui sit honor et gloria sine fine. Amen. Amen. Explicit liber quartus sequitur quintus”; (158v-170r) Lib V. Incipit: “Dissolutis hereticorum, iudeorum et saracenorum bellis, restat experiri in hoc quinto libro et ultimo”; explicit: “Tibi tibi bone Ihesu qui es turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, sit honor et gloria, benedictio et gratiarum actio sine fine. Amen. Amen amen amen amen amen amen. Explicit quintus liber de bello demonum contra fidei Fortalicium”. (170v-176v) Tabula. Incipit: “Tabula Fortalitii Fidei. Incipit cuius sunt libri quinque et premititur prohemium in quo laudes diuine annotantur”; explicit: “Tercius passus est de reclusionione perpetua demonum in inferno”; (176v-176v) Liber III, decima consideratio [De sacrilegio patrato anno mcccxxv in ciuitate Segobiensi]. Incipit: “Nota adhuc de Iudeis unum mirabile quod accidit in ciuitate Segobiensi anno Domini mccccxv regnante domino Iohanne in tenera etate”; explicit: “qui fuit presens cum Iudei apportauerunt corpus dominicum praedicto priori et cum supradicta omnia acciderunt”.

History: fifteenth century. This manuscript formerly belonged to the Bibliotheca Vallis Sancti Martini (Leuven), see f. 85. There is a stamp of the Bibliothèque nationale de France, ff. 1r, 176v. Nothing seems to indicate that there was a coat of arms.

## 2.2. Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 7497

The manuscript is described with certain inaccuracies in Van den Gheyn<sup>12</sup>. It is also wrongly referenced in the catalogue Thomas, *et al.*<sup>13</sup> under the note: Madrid, Biblioteca Real, 7497. This modest codex commences every book with a small decorated initial. It has, at the end of the entire text, a note with the tenth consideration of book III. There are some similarities between this manuscript and the previous manuscript Bruxelles, Koninklijke Biblio-

<sup>12</sup> The catalogue does not correctly indicate the foliation of this manuscript. This mistake at the beginning of the description, which starts with the *tabula*, makes all the other foliation data go astray. Likewise, it does not include information related to the columns, lines, script or information on the decorated initials. See: Van den Gheyn 1903, p. 103.

<sup>13</sup> Thomas, *et al.* 2013, p. 454.

theek van België MS 156-157 as well as Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS II 83 and El Burgo de Osma, Catedral de la Asunción del Burgo de Osma MS 154.

Material description: paper; 202 ff.; 395 mm x 285 mm; 2 columns; irregular lines (50-56); gothic hybrid. Initials: big decorated initials (ff. 1r, 6r, 7r, 35r, 53v, 132r, 186r) and also smaller initials, which are all completed. There are no illuminations. There is a blank page (f. 148v).

(1r-5r) Tabula. Incipit: “Tabula Fortaliti Fidei. Incipit cuius sunt quinque libri et premititur prohemium in quo laudes diuine annotantur”; explicit: “Tercius passus est de reclusionem perpetua demonum in inferno. Explicit tabula quinque librorum Fortalicii”; (5v) blank fol. (6r-v) Prohemium. Incipit: “Turris fortitudinis a facie inimici. Tu es Domine deus meus qui facis magna et inscrutabilia et mirabilia. quorum non est numerus”; explicit: “bellum Saracenorum et Christianorum deseruit quarto, ademones uero ab angelis prostrati deseruiunt quinto libro”; (7r-35r) Lib I. Incipit: “Vt detur ordo in presenti libro, quinque erunt principales libri quasi quinque turres Fortalicii fidei inexpugnabiles”; explicit: “cui honor laus benedictio et gloria sine fine amen. Amen. Explicit liber primus sequitur secundus qui est de bello hereticorum contra nostre fidei Fortalicium”; (35r-53v) Lib II. Incipit: “Antiquorum in libris legimus gentilium milites humanam uenerantes gloriam generose diuersa monstrorum genera destruxisse”; explicit: “Domini nostri Ihesus Christi cui est honor et gloria in secula seculorum. Amen”; (53v-131v) Lib III. Incipit: “Hereticorum bello quasi periculosiori soluto, cum sit a familiaribus inimicis latenter commissum”; explicit: “Cuius singulari presidio fides christianorum inuiolabilis sine fine perseuerat. Amen. Explicit liber tercius qui est de bello iudeorum sequitur quartus liber qui est de bello saracenorum”; (132r-185v) Lib IV. Incipit: “Incipit liber quartus de saracenorum bello contra nostrum fidei Fortalicium, Iudeorum enim bello. Viriliter ut deus tradidit dissoluto iam experiri oportet in hoc libro quarto sarracenorum uires”; explicit: “qui est turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, cui sit honor et gloria sine fine. Amen. Explicit liber quartus sequitur quintus”; (186r-201r) Lib V. Incipit: “Dissolutis hereticorum, iudeorum et saracenorum bellis, restat experiri in hoc libro quinto et ultimo”; explicit: “Tibi tibi bone Ihesu qui es turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, sit honor et gloria, benedictio et gratiarum actio sine fine. Amen. Amen. Amen”. (201v) Liber III, decima consideratio [De sacrilegio patrato anno mcccxxv in ciuitate Segobiensi]. Incipit: “Nota adhuc de Iudeis unum mirabile quod accidit in ciuitate Segobiensi anno Domini mccccxxv regnante domino Iohanne in tenera etate”; explicit: “qui fuit presens cum Iudei apportauerunt corpus dominicum predicto priori et cum supradicta omnia acciderunt”.

History: fifteenth century. This manuscript formerly belonged to the Bibliotheca Tongerloensis (Tongerlo)<sup>14</sup>, see f. 2. Nothing seems to indicate that there was a coat of arms.

### 2.3. Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 9524

This manuscript is described with some errors in Van den Gheyn<sup>15</sup>. The catalogue Thomas, *et al.*<sup>16</sup> identifies this manuscript incorrectly as: Madrid, Biblioteca Real, 9524. It is a codex with two large illuminations at the beginning, one representing Alfonso de Espina reading his book (f. 1v) and the other representing the Fortress of the Faith with its enemies (f. 3r), but it does not have all the initials decorated<sup>17</sup>. At the end, there is a passage from

---

<sup>14</sup> Based on this information, certain historical correlations between manuscripts can be established. Specifically, it is possible to link the manuscripts Bruxelles MS 7497, Bruxelles MS 156-157 and Bruxelles II 83. The Tongerlo abbey had a very dedicated cultural commitment in the fifteenth century, that ended up with the opening of the University of Leuven. It does not seem surprising, then, that these three manuscripts appear in the same territory. It is possible that Henri van Zomeren (1418-1472) contributed to the circulation of the *Fortalitium fidei* in this territory. This academic had close contact with the University of Leuven, where he studied and later taught philosophy, and had some institutional relations with Rome and Paris. Years later, thanks to Thierry van Tulden (1462-1494), he established closer ties with Parc Abbey and its library. In this sense, it does not seem unreasonable to relate the circulation of manuscripts between the Tongerlo abbey and the Leuven libraries with his name. Cf. Coppens 2010, pp. 23-70; Hulin de Loo, *et al.* 1938, pp. 467-469.

<sup>15</sup> The foliation of the manuscript is not indicated correctly nor is the separation of the sections of the book. The foliation of the final *tabula* is rendered with mistakes which also affects the foliation of the note at the end of the book. Moreover, there is no information about: lines, script or decorated initials, although there is a brief description of the illuminations. See: Van den Gheyn 1903, p. 103.

<sup>16</sup> Thomas, *et al.* 2013, p. 454.

<sup>17</sup> The *Fortalitium fidei* has a very specific pictorial program, it represents the siege of the Fortress of Faith by the enemies of Catholicism: heretics, Jewish, Saracens and demons. This iconographic representation seems to complete the central allegory of the treatise, presented in the *prohemium*: its five books represent the five towers of the fortress of Christianity. Above all, it seems that there was a special attention paid to the luxurious manuscripts of the French translation. Some of them were made following the style from the workshop of the Flemish miniaturist and illuminator Loyset Liédet. Cf. Kren, McKendrick 2003, pp. 247-248. Although all the representations appear to follow a common pattern, there are considerable differences between some of the miniatures and woodcuts in the manuscripts and printed editions. Sometimes it is a representation of a fortress with one tower besieged by all its enemies (Valenciennes, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 244; ed. Basel (Bernard Richel) [1475]; ed. Lyon (Guillaume Balsarin) [1487]; Bruxelles MS 9524), sometimes a fortress with five towers besieged by all its enemies (El Burgo de Osma MS 154; ed. Strasburg (Jean Mentelin) [ante 1472]), and sometimes a fortress with its corresponding enemy at the beginning of each book (London, British Museum, MS Royal 17 F vi, vii; Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France: Fonds français, MS 20067-69; Bruxelles, Bibliothèque royale MS 9007; Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek MS 2535; Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, MS 2536; Den Haag, Koninklijke Bibliotheek MS 133 A 6). Potentially, the contrasting iconographies could help to establish different traditions of the work. See some of these iconographic descriptions in: Falk 2017, pp. 17-87.



the sixth consideration of Book III. While there are some similarities with Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 156-157, this manuscript seems to be more sumptuous.

Material description: paper; 213 ff.; 338 mm x 275 mm; 2 columns; regular lines (60); gothic hybrid. Initials: big decorated initials (f. 2r), all remaining initials are likewise completed. Decoration: big illuminations (ff. 1v, 3r).

(i) miniature; (1r-v) Prohemium. Incipit: “Incipit liber qui intitulatur Fortalitiū fidei catholici. Turris fortitudinis a facie inimici. Tu es Domine deus meus qui facis magna et inscrutabilia et mirabilia. quorum non est numerus”; explicit: “bellum Sarracenorum et Christianorum deseruit quarto, demones uero ab angelis prostrati deseruiunt quinto libro”; (2r) miniature; (3v-34v) Lib I. Incipit: “Vt detur ordo in presenti libro, quinque erunt parcialis libri quasi quinque turros Fortalicii fidei inexpugnabiles”; explicit: “cui honor laus benedictio et gloria sine fine amen. Explicit liber primus Fortalicii fidei”; (34v-53v) Lib II. Incipit: “Incipit liber secundus qui est de bello hereticorum. Antiquorum in libris legimus gentilium milites humanam uenerantes gloriam generose diuersa monstrorum genera destruxisse”; explicit: “Domini nostri Ihesus Christi cui est honor et gloria in secula seculorum. Amen”; (54r-125v) Lib III. Incipit: “Incipit liber tercius de iudeorum bello contra fidei nostre Fortalitiū. Hereticorum bello quasi periculosiori soluto, cum sit a familiaribus inimicis latenter commissum”; explicit: “Cuius singulari presidio fides christianorum inuiolabilis sine fine perseueret. Amen. Explicit liber tercius Fortalicii”; (125v-187v) Lib IV. Incipit: “Incipit liber quartus. Viriliter ut deus tradidit dissoluto iam experiri oportet in hoc libro quarto sarracenorum uires”; explicit: “qui est turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, cui sit honor set gloria sine fine. Amen. Explicit liber quartus”; (187v-202r) Lib V. Incipit: “Incipit liber quintus. De bellis demonum contra fidei Fortalicium. Dissolutis hereticorum, iudeorum et sarracenorum bellis, restat experiri in hoc libro quinto et ultimo”; explicit: “Tibi bone Ihesu qui es turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, sit honor et gloria, benedictio et graciaram actio sine fine. Amen. Sequitur tabula Fortalicii fidei”. (202v-208r) Tabula. Incipit: “Tabula Fortalitii fidei. Incipit cuius sunt libri quinque et premititur prohemium in quo laudes diuine annotantur”; explicit: “Tercius passus est de reclusionē perpetua demonum in inferno. Et sic est fine”; (208v-210r) Liber III, sexta consideratio [Quintum impossibile-Decimum impossibile]. Incipit: “Peccatis humani generis. Respondetur quod, quamvis Christus pro peccatis humani generis sua morte sufficienter satisfecerit”; explicit: “Christianis quod est in memoriam illius panis Christi, licet iste panis non sit ille”; (i) blank.

History: fifteenth century. This manuscript formerly belonged to the Collegium Anglorum Societatis Iesu, see f. 2r. There is also the coat of arms of Belgium (ff. 2r, 2v).

## 2.4. Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS II 83

This manuscript is very briefly described in Van den Gheyn<sup>18</sup>; every book of this codex has a small illuminated initial, but there are no big illuminations. This manuscript shows some similarities with Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 156-157, Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 7497 and El Burgo de Osma, Catedral de la Asunción del Burgo de Osma MS 154.

Material description: paper, although a few sheets of parchment are interspersed; 229 ff.; 380 mm x 268 mm; 2 columns; irregular lines (51-53); gothic hybrid. Initials: big decorated initials (ff. 1r, 11r, 12r, 46v, 69r, 152r, 214r), all other smaller initials are likewise completed. There are no illuminations. There are some blank pages (ff. 7v-10v).

(1r-7r) Tabula. Incipit: “Tabula Fortalicii incipit cuius sunt libri quinque et premittitur prohemium in quo laudes diuine annotantur”; explicit: “Tercius passus est de reclusionem perpetua demum in inferno. Et sic est finis”; (7v-10v) blank fol. (11r-12r) Prohemium. Incipit: “Turris fortitudinis a facie inimici. Tu es Domine deus meus qui facis magna et inscrutabilia et mirabilia quorum non est numerus”; explicit: “bellum Saracenorum et Christianorum deseruit quarto, demones uero ab angelis prostrati deseruiunt quinto libro”; (12r-46v) Lib I. Incipit: “Vt detur ordo in presenti libro, quinque erunt principales libri quasi quinque turres Fortalicii fidei inexpugnabiles”; explicit: “cui honor laus benedictio et gloria sine fine amen”; (46v-151v) Lib II. Incipit: “Incipit liber secundus scilicet de bello hereticorum contra nostrum fidei Fortalicium. Antiquorum in libris legimus gentilium milites humanam uenerantes gloriam generose diuersa monstrorum genera destruxisse”; explicit: “Domini nostri Ihesus Christi cui est honor et gloria in secula seculorum. Amen”; (69r-151v) Lib III. Incipit: “Incipit liber tercius scilicet de bello iudeorum contra nostrum fidei Fortalicium. Hereticorum bello quasi periculosiori soluto, cum sit a familiaribus inimicis latenter commissum”; explicit: “Cuius singulari presidio fides christianorum inuiolabilis sine fine perseueret. Amen. Explicit liber tercius sequitur quartus”; (152r-213v) Lib IV. Incipit: “Incipit liber quartus Fortalicii istius. Iudeorum bello. Viriliter ut deus tradidit dissoluto iam experiri oportet in hoc libro quarto saracenorum uires”; explicit: “qui est turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, cui sit honor et gloria sine fine. Amen. Amen. Explicit liber quartus sequitur quintus”; (214r-228v) Lib V. Incipit: “Dissolutis hereticorum, iudeorum et saracenorum bellis, restat experiri in hoc libro quinto et ultimo”; explicit: “Tibi tibi bone Ihesu qui es turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, sit honor et gloria, benedictio et gratiarum actio sine fine. Amen. Amen”.

<sup>18</sup> The description of this manuscript is correct, but the catalogue does not include information about lines, script or decorated initials. See: Van den Gheyn 1903, pp. 103-104.

History: fifteenth century. This manuscript formerly belonged to the Bibliothèque Parc (Leuven), see f. 1r. There is a note on the verso of the cover that indicates that later this codex became part of the Bibliothèque de Feu de Monseigneur Pierre François Xavier de Ram (1837). The volume was acquired by the Bibliothèque royale in 1872. There is a non identified coat of arms (f. 11r).

## 2.5. El Burgo de Osma, Catedral de la Asunción del Burgo de Osma MS 154

This manuscript is described in Rojo Orcajo<sup>19</sup>; unfortunately, this catalogue contains certain inaccuracies<sup>20</sup>; It is also referenced in the catalogues Reinhardt, Santiago-Otero<sup>21</sup> and Thomas, *et al.*<sup>22</sup>. The codex is decorated with numerous delicate miniatures, which are drawn and shaded in pen and occasionally detailed with pigment, apparently there is no order in their distribution throughout the manuscript. The biggest illumination corresponds to a representation of the Fortress of the Faith (f. 10r). Yet, the first, fourth and fifth book do not have any initials at the beginning, so it seems that the illuminations were not finished. There are some similarities between this manuscript and Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 7497 and Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS II 83.

Material description: parchment; 180 ff.; 365 mm x 276 mm; 2 columns; irregular lines (54-69); gothic. Initials: decorated initials (ff. 1r, 9r, 38v, 55r), but all the other initials are not completed. Decorations: Floral filigrees (f. 1r); big illuminations (ff. 10r, 108r, 149v, 151v, 154v, 158v, 161r, 162r, 165v, 168r, 170r, 171v, 174v, 178r); small illuminations (ff. 42r, 147v, 150r, 151v, 153v, 154r, 154v, 155r, 156r, 156v, 158r, 158v, 159v, 160r, 162r, 162v, 163r, 163v, 165v, 166v).

(1r-8v) Tabula. Incipit: “Tabula Fortalitii Fidei. Incipit cuius sunt libri quinque et premititur prohemium in quo laudes diuine annotantur”; explicit: “Tercius passus est de reclusionem perpetua demonum in inferno. Explicit tabula Fortalicii fidei”; (9r-10v) Prohemium. Incipit: “Turris fortitudinis a facie inimici. Tu es Domine deus meus qui facis magna et inscrutabilia et mirabilia. quorum non est numerus”; explicit: “bellum Sarracenorum et Christianorum deseruit quarto, demones

<sup>19</sup> Rojo Orcajo 1929, p. 244.

<sup>20</sup> Rojo Orcajo's catalogue is not very detailed. The catalogue separates only the *tabula* and the book, indicating the first *folio* of the *tabula* and both the *incipit* and *explicit* of the whole book. It does not single out the *prohemium* nor the five books of the treatise. It also contains material and chronological information (material, foliation, dimensions, lines, script, century, binding and label). At the end of the description, there are a couple of notes on the illuminations and the coat of arms. Unfortunately, the foliation and the description of the lines are wrong. There is also no information about columns, decorated initials or foliation of the illuminations.

<sup>21</sup> Reinhardt, Santiago-Otero 1986, p. 63.

<sup>22</sup> Thomas, *et al.* 2013, p. 454.

uero ab angelis prostrati deseruiunt quinto libro”; (11r-38v) Lib I. Incipit: “[V]t detur ordo in presenti libro, quinque erunt principales libri quasi quinque turres Fortalicii fidei in expugnabiles”; explicit: “cui honor laus benedictio et gloria sine fine amen. Explicit liber primus Fortalicii fidei”; (38v-55r) Lib II. Incipit: “Incipit liber secundus qui est de bello hereticorum. Antiquorum in libris legimus gentilium milites humanam uenerantes gloriam generose diuersa monstrorum genera destruxisse”; explicit: “Domini nostri Ihesus Christi cui est honor et gloria in secula seculorum. Amen”; (55r-116v) Lib III. Incipit: “Incipit liber tercius qui est de iudeorum bello contra fidei Fortalitium. Hereticorum bello quasi piculosiori soluto, cum sit a familiaribus inimicis latenter commissum”; explicit: “Cuius singulari presidio fides christianorum inuiolabilis sine fine perseueret. Amen. Explicit liber tercius Fortalicii fidei”; (116v-174v) Lib IV. Incipit: “Incipit liber quartus de sarracenorum bello, [B]ello Iudeorum. Viriliter ut deus tradidit dissoluto iam experiri oportet in hoc libro quarto sarracenorum uires”; explicit: “qui est turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, cui sit honor et gloria sine fine. Amen. Liber quartus Fortalitium fidei explicit”; (174v-180v) Lib V. Incipit: “Liber quintus incipit. [D]isolutis hereticorum, iudeorum et sarracenorum bellis, restat experiri in hoc libro quinto et ultimo”; explicit: “Tibi, domine Ihesu, qui es turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, sit honor et gloria, benedictio et gratiarum actio sine fine. Amen. Explicit Fortalitium fidei. Scriptor ipsius fuit Garsias de Santo Stephano de Gorniacio. Deo Gratias. De mandato domini petri episcopi oxomen. 1464”.

History: fifteenth century (1464). Copyist: García de San Esteban de Gormaz. Commissioned by Bishop Pedro de Montoya, whose coat of arms appears on the first page (f. 1r)<sup>23</sup>.

## 2.6. Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque de l’Agglomération du Pays de Saint-Omer MS 144

This manuscript is described with some errors in Michelant<sup>24</sup>; it is a luxurious codex highly decorated and whose initials are coloured. It is the only

<sup>23</sup> This manuscript is the only one preserved in Castile and the oldest one. While only one single manuscript has been discovered within the Iberian territory, I suspect that further Latin manuscripts may be present in the Cathedral of Valladolid, the city where Alfonso de Espina wrote his treatise, although there are severe restrictions to check their inventory. This manuscript represents the closest testimony of the production context of Alfonso de Espina.

<sup>24</sup> Michelant’s description of the manuscript is poor, although some of its information is correct. On the one hand, the author and the work’s title are wrong, that is: *S. Bernardi libri V de consideratione*. Being able to locate the manuscript and identify it with the *Fortalitium fidei* has been fortunate. The catalogue does not separate any sections of the book and only indicates the *incipit*, *explicit* and the final rubric. It also contains material and chronological information (century, material, binding, column, script, decorations, provenance). There is no information about its foliation, and its *incipit* and *explicit* are wrong. There is also no information about dimensions, lines and foliation of the decorations. See: Michelant 1861, p. 79.

ruled manuscript. This codex shares some features with Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS 7497, Bruxelles, Koninklijke Bibliotheek van België MS II 83 and El Burgo de Osma, Catedral de la Asunción del Burgo de Osma MS 154.

Material description: parchment; 310 ff.; 373 mm x 261 mm; 2 columns; regular lines (41); gothic semi-hybrid. Initials: big decorated initials (ff. 1r, 9v, 11r, 64r, 95v, 197r, 288r), all the other smaller initials are likewise completed. There are no illuminations.

(1r-9v) Tabula. Incipit: “Tabula Fortalicii fidei incipit cuius sunt libri quinque. Et premititur prohemium in quo laudes diuine annotantur”; explicit: “Tercius passus est de reclusionione perpetua demonum in inferno. Explicit tabula libri huius. Sequitur prologus”; (9v-11r) Prohemium. Incipit: “Prohemium. Turris fortitudinis a facie inimici. Tu es Domine deus meus qui facis magna et inscrutabilia et mirabilia, quorum non est numerus”; explicit: “bellum Sarracenorum et Christianorum deseruit quarto. Demones uero ab angelis prostrati deseruiunt quinto libro”; (11r-63v) Lib I. Incipit: “Incipit liber primus. Vt detur ordo in presenti libro, quinque erunt particulares libri quasi quinque tures Fortalicii fidei inexpugnabiles”; explicit: “cui honor laus benedictio et gloria sine fine amen. Explicit liber primus Fortalicii fidei”; (63v-95v) Lib II. Incipit: “Incipit liber secundus qui est de bello hereticorum. Antiquorum in libris legimus gentilium milites humanam uenerantes gloriam genere diuersa monstrorum genera destruxisse”; explicit: “Domini nostri Ihesus Christi cui est honor et gloria in secula seculorum. Amen”; (95v-196v) Lib III. Incipit: “Incipit liber tercius de iudeorum bello contra fidei Fortalicium. Hereticorum bello quasi periculosiori soluto, cum sit a familiaribus inimicis latenter commissum”; explicit: “Cuius singulari presidio fides christianorum inuiolabilis sine fine perseueret. Amen. Explicit liber tercius Fortalicii fidei”; (196v-288r) Lib IV. Incipit: “Incipit quartus. Iudeo uiriliter ut deus tradidit dissoluto iam experiri oportet in hoc libro quarto sarracenorum uires”; explicit: “qui est turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, cui sit honor et gloria sine fine. Amen. Explicit liber quartus Fortalicii fidei”; (288r-309v) Lib V. Incipit: “Et incipit quintus. Deuictis iudeorum et saracenorum bellis, restat experiri in hoc libro quinto et ultimo”; explicit: “Tibi bone Ihesu qui es turris fortitudinis a facie inimici, sit honor gloria, benedictio et gratiarum actio sine fine. Amen. (Colophon) Completus fuit iste liber scriptura in uigilia Assumptionis Beate Marie Virginis, anno Domini millesimo quadringentesimo septuagesimo. Per Petrum Richard presbyterum”.

History: fifteenth century (14<sup>th</sup>, August 1470). This manuscript formerly belonged to the Abbaye de Saint-Bertin (Saint-Omer). Copyist: the

codex was copied by Pierre Richard, see f. 390v. The page where the coat of arms was supposed to be is trimmed, f. 1r<sup>25</sup>.

### 3. DESCRIPTION OF THE LATIN *EXCERPTA* OF THE *FORTALITIUM FIDEI*

Nine Latin *excerpta* of the *Fortalitium fidei* have come down to us. Chronologically they all belong to the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. They are preserved in libraries in Germany (5), Austria (1), the Netherlands (1), Poland (1) and the United States of America (1). I provide a codicological description of each of them:

#### 3.1. Augsburg, Staats- und Stadtbibliothek Augsburg. MS 8 Cod 203 (ff. 39v-51v)

This manuscript is described in detail in Trede, Gehrt<sup>26</sup>. It is a humble manuscript that collects Christian prayers<sup>27</sup>. The *excerptum* of the *Fortalitium fidei* corresponds to a transcription of the *prohemium*<sup>28</sup>.

Material description: paper; 102 ff.; 115 mm x 85 mm; 1 column; irregular lines (19-20); gothic cursive. There are neither big decorated initials nor illuminations.

This manuscript is titled *Libellus precum*. It contains: (1r-2v) *Orationes*; (3r-19r) *Precatio ad Christum*; (19v-39r) *Oratio ad Beatam Mariam Virginem*; (39v-51r) Alphonsus de Spina, *Fortalitium fidei*; (51r-53v) Anselmus Cantuariensis, *Meditationes*;

---

<sup>25</sup> This is the first time that this manuscript of Saint-Omer is listed as part of the *Fortalitium fidei* codices. The discovery of the Saint-Omer manuscript allows linking the Latin manuscript tradition to the French translation of the *Fortalitium fidei*, because the manuscript's colloquium indicates that it was produced in the workshop of Pierre Richard, that is, the translator of the French version.

<sup>26</sup> The Trede, Gehrt catalogue is very complete. It offers material content and chronological information (material, foliation, dimensions, origin, century, description of the material, possessors, secondary literature and description of each *excerptum*). The *incipit* and *explicit* of each *excerptum* are also indicated with their corresponding foliation. See: Trede, Gehrt 2011, pp. 359-361.

<sup>27</sup> This prayerbook is full of *notae in margine* by different hands, so it may have been a book of recurring use. The first owner of this manuscript is not known, so it can't be determined whether, in its origins, this codex had a communal or private use. Some of the notes are intertextual indications that refer to the sacred Christian texts. It seems more probable that this codex was indeed intended for liturgical use rather than for devotional private readings.

<sup>28</sup> The content of this *excerptum* matches with München MS Clm 14081. The text with pigment on the initial "T" of each sentence seems to recall the edition printed in Basel (Bernard Richel [1475]).

(53v-54v) *Notae*; (55r-57v) *Legatus Divinae Pietatis Sanctae Gertrudis*; (57v-64r) *Liber specialis gratiae sanctae Mechtildis*; (64v-66r) *Oratio pro anima in purgatorio*; (66v) *Excerpta breuia*; (67r-68r) *Oratio*; (69r-72v) *De oratione*; (73r-75v) *Meditationes de passione domini*; (77r-78r) *Notae*; (79r-92r) *Confessio cotidiana*; (92v-98v) *De peccatis*; (99r-102r) *Notae*.

History: sixteenth century. This manuscript was in Southern Germany<sup>29</sup>. It appears that this manuscript was owned by the Kartause Buxheim and also by the Counts of Waldbott Bassenheim.

### 3.2. Darmstadt, Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek Darmstadt. MS 146 (f. 218r-v)

This manuscript is described in detail in Knaus, Staub<sup>30</sup>. This humble manuscript incorporates controversial and apologetic religious texts. The *excerptum* of the *Fortalitium fidei* corresponds to a resumé of a part of the fifth book *De bello daemomum*<sup>31</sup>.

Material description: paper; 266 ff.; 280 mm x 210 mm; 1 column (only 2 columns in ff. 211-217); irregular lines (37-45); gothic *bastarda*. The first 9 pages are numbered in Roman numerals. There are neither big decorated initials nor illuminations.

This manuscript is titled *Orosius*. It contains: (IIr-IVv) Lactantius, *Institutionum Epitome*; (Vr-VIIIv) blank; (IXr-109v) Orosius, *Historiarum aduersum paganos libri VII*; (110r-111v) blank; (1r-209r) Bartholomaeus Platina: *Vitae Pontificum*; (209v-210v) blank; (211r-217v) Isidorus Hispalensis, *Chronica*; (218r-v) Alphonsus

<sup>29</sup> Most of the following *excerpta* of the *Fortalitium fidei* can be related to the territory of the Empire, specifically: Augsburg MS 8 Cod 203; Darmstadt MS 146; München MS Clm 14081; München MS Clm 22371; Wrocław MS I Q 73 a; and Würzburg MS M.ch.q.156. This phenomenon seems to be a direct consequence of the technological revolution brought about by Gutenberg's printing press and of the near printers that reproduced the work of the *Fortalitium fidei* (Strasburg, Basel, Nürnberg and Lyon). The Black Death, the schism of the church and the German dynastic wars sparked a political turmoil in the heart of Europe and, indeed, helped to make controversial religious texts more valued by pre-modern society. In the same way, the new political relations between Habsburg and Castile seem to have been fundamental for the circulation and diffusion of Castilian works outside the Iberian world.

<sup>30</sup> This catalogue is complete and detailed. It provides material, foliation, dimensions, origin, chronology, property, material description, binding, secondary literature and foliation of each *excerptum*. See: Knaus, Staub 1979, pp. 94-95.

<sup>31</sup> Specifically, this resumé refers to the first consideration and part of the second consideration of the fifth book of the *Fortalitium fidei*, in which the nature of demons and occult science is described. This manuscript could be a *compendium* of religious polemics and theological and historical fragments.

deSpina, *Fortalitium fidei contra fidei christianae hostes*; (219r-220v) blank; (221r-248v) Beda Venerabilis, *Chronicamaiora*; (248v-250v) Aurelius Augustinus, *De perfectione iustitiae hominis*; (251r-254v) Papias, *Vocabularium*; (255r-266v) Extracts.

History: fifteenth century (1490-1500). This manuscript was produced in Wesel (Germany), see f. IIr.

### 3.3. Groningen, Universiteitsbibliotheek. MS 103 (f. 19r-v)

This manuscript is described in detail in Brugmans<sup>32</sup>; it is a codex devoted to theology and medieval philosophy that incorporates some illuminations and tables of astronomical, geometric and musical content. The *Fortalitium fidei's excerptum* corresponds to a transcription of a part of the fifth book *De bello daemum*<sup>33</sup>.

Material description: paper; 274 ff.; 140 mm x 103 mm; 1 column; irregular lines (32-39); gothic cursive. Illustration and decorations: some texts contain musical notation and geometrical figures.

This manuscript contains: (1r-2v) Tabula; (3r-13v) Albertus Magnus, *Speculum astronomiae*; (13v-18v) Anonymus, *Sufficiencia divisionis mathematicae*; (19r-v) Alphonsus de Spina, *Fortalitium fidei contra Iudeos, Sarracenos aliosque christiane fidei inimicos*; (20r-67v) Heinrich Kramer, *Malleus maleficarum*; (68r-95v, 119r-121v, 123r-v) Nicolas Oresme, *Tractatus de configurationibus qualitatum et motuum*; (96v-118v, 128r-144v) Roger Bacon, *Opus Maius*; (122r-v, 124r-127v) Robert Grosseteste, *De iride*; (145v-147v) Charles de Bouelles, *Liber de circuli quadratura circuli*; (147v-149v) Charles de Bouelles, *Liber de cubicatione sphaerae*; (153r-166r) Nicolaus Cusanus, *Tractatus de mathematicis complementis*; (166r-169r) Nicolaus Cusanus, *Liber de mathematica perfectione*; (169r-177v) Nicolaus Cusanus, *Tractatus de reparatione kalendarii*; (177v-182v) Nicolaus Cusanus, *Idiota de staticis experimentis*; (182v-193v) Johannes de Muris, *Tractatus de correctione kalendarii*; (194r-v) *De progressionem numerorum*; (194v) *Aenigma de progressionem*; (194v) *De mensuratione per numerorum proportionem*; (195r-196r) *Nomina stellarum fixarum*; (196v-201v) *Notabilia aliquae de signis complexionum hominum*; (201v-207r) Vincent of Beauvais, *Speculum*

<sup>32</sup> The Brugmans catalogue is succinct. It describes material, dimensions, foliation, initials decorated and century. It also notes the different *excerpta* with its title, author, *incipit* and *explicit*. See: Brugmans 1898, pp. 6-41.

<sup>33</sup> It is a literal transcription of the second passage of the second consideration: “Quod artes magice demonum scientia exercentur”, in which the science of demons is presented, such as: necromancy, pyromancy, aeromancy, hydromancy, geomancy and chiromancy.



*naturale*; (207v-214r) Boethius, *Geometria, liber II*; (214r-216r) Boethius, *Geometria, liber I*; (216r-221v) Boethius, *Arithmetica, libri I-II*; (222r-223v) *Regulae de mutationibus aeris ad pluuiam*; (224r-v) Petrus Crinitus, *De honesta disciplina, lib. XXI*; (225r-v) Nicolaus Cusanus, *Determinatio carenae quadragenae et septenae*; (225v-230v) *Tractatus de musica*; (231r-232r) Paulus de Middelburg, *De decem quaestionibus propositis Johanni Lichtenberger*; (232r-v) Everhard de Warendorp, *Canon*; (233r) *Margarita physica de lineis*; (233v) *Abacus de metrorum pedibus*; (234r-39r) *Tabulae de ordinato ac debito victualium foro*; (239v-242r) *Tabulae de mensuratione terrarum secundum modum Hollandorum et ceterarum regionum*; (242v-243r) *Tafel van onderdelen van roeden, voeten en duimen*; (243v) *Tafel van morgens en pondematen*; (244r-246v) *Tafel van landhuren*; (247r-248r) *Tabula longitudinum calamorum in Westergo*; (248v-267v) *Tabula per talentata Frisiaca*; (268r) *Over kwadraten en cirkels*; (268v-270r) *Manier om ronselen te maken*; (271r) *Calculatio areae circuli*; (271v) *Tabula cordarum mediatarum*; (272r) *Residuum tabulae*; (273v) *Tabula differentiae minorum proportionalium*; (274r-v) *Verklaring der tabula cordarum mediatarum*.

History: sixteenth century (1500-1525). This manuscript may have been produced in Thabor, Friesland (Netherlands)<sup>34</sup>. This book appears to have been owned in the seventeenth century by Walterus ab Enchusen, see f. 3r.

### 3.4. München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek MS Clm 14081 (ff. 89v-91v)

This manuscript is described in Wunderle<sup>35</sup>; it contains some biblical epistles and the work of Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagite. The text of the *Fortalitium fidei*, which corresponds to the prologue, is presented as a popular prayer.

Material description: paper; 199 ff.; 325 mm x 220 mm; 2 columns; irregular lines (30-31); gothic cursive. There are some big decorated initials, but there are no illuminations.

This manuscript contains: (1r-73v) *Epistulae Pauli cum prologis*; (74r-89v) *Epistulae Canonicae cum prologis*; (89v-91v) Alfonso de Spina, *Fortalitium fidei*; (92r-93v) blank; (94r) Martianus Capella, *De nuptiis Philologiae et Mercurii*; (95r-199r) Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita, *Opera omnia [De mystica theologia; De*

<sup>34</sup> The existence of an *excerptum* in Burgundian territory seems to be related to the manuscripts produced in this same area.

<sup>35</sup> The information offered in this catalogue is: material, foliation, dimensions, origin, chronology, material description, binding and foliation of each *excerptum*. See: Wunderle 1995, pp. 186-188.

*diuinis nominibus; De caelesti hierarchia; De ecclesiastica hierarchia*]; (199r) Pseudo-Ignatius Antiochenus, *Epistulae*.

History: fifteenth century (1450-1500). This manuscript formerly belonged to the abbey of St. Emmeram (Bavaria)<sup>36</sup>.

### 3.5. München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek MS Clm 22371 (ff. 1r-13v)

This manuscript is very briefly described in Halm, Meyer<sup>37</sup>; it is a *compendium* mainly of sermons. The *extracts* from the *Fortalitium fidei* are a transcription, sometimes paraphrastic and sometimes literal, of a large part of the first book, that is: *De armatura omnium fidelium*, and of some passages from the third book *De bello Iudeorum*.

Material description: paper; 336 ff.; 310 mm x 205 mm; 2 columns; irregular lines (46-47); gothic. There are neither big decorated initials nor illuminations.

This manuscript contains: (1r-13v) Alphonsus de Spina, *Fortalitium fidei*; (14r-25v) *Notae*; (26r-66v) Albertus Magnus, *Sermones de corpore Christi*; (67r-73v) *Assertio Thaboritarum siue Hussitorum*; (73r-90v) Augustinus de Ancona, *Super Magnificat*; (91r-102v) *Sermones*; (103r-110v) Henricus de Hassia, *De IV instinctibus*; (111r-265v) *Sermones*; (266r-309v) Siboto, *Sermones super Miserere*; (310r-312v) *Versus 'Obstans in ueste veneri confer manifeste'*; (313r-336v) *Sententiae collectae de amore, affluentia, aduentu iudicii, etc.*

History: fifteenth century (1450-1500). This manuscript was formerly kept in Windberg (Bavaria).

### 3.6. San Marino (CA), The Huntington Library MS HM 1068 (f. I)

This manuscript is described in Dutschke<sup>38</sup>; it is an elegant codex with texts from different doctors of the church. The *Fortalitium fidei* is added at the final page by the same hand as the text of the first guard sheets, it corre-

<sup>36</sup> There are two *excerpta* of *Fortalitium Fidei* from Bavaria, i.e. München MS Clm 14081 and München MS Clm 22371. This situation might be explained in the context of the editions printed by Anton Koberger in Nürnberg.

<sup>37</sup> The catalogue offers very little information on the manuscripts. In this specific case: origin, chronology, foliation and the title of each *excerptum* it contains. In fact, the *Fortalitium fidei*, which corresponds to the first *excerptum* of the manuscript, is not well identified in the catalogue. See: Halm, Meyer 1969, p. 44.

<sup>38</sup> The Dutschke catalogue is quite accurate. It refers to: material, foliation, dimensions, origin, chronology, material description, illuminations, script, binding, foliation and description of each *excerptum*, location and secondary bibliography. See: Dutschke 1989, pp. 339-341.

sponds to the first *thesaurus* of the fourth point of the sixth article of the third consideration of book one<sup>39</sup>.

Material description: parchment; 168 ff.; 138 mm x 210 mm; 1 column; regular lines (25); gothic *bastarda*. There are some big decorated initials and different illuminations.

This manuscript contains: (i) Eusebius Cremonensis, *De morte Hieronymi ad Damasum*; (ii) Innocent III, *De Misera Humane Conditionis*; (1r-61r) Ephraem, *De compunctione cordis*; (61r) Jerome, *De uiribus illustribus*; (61r-v) Pseudo Jerome, *Verba seniorum*; (62r-104r) Ailred of Rievaulx, *De Institutis Inclusarum*; (104v-107r), *Hours of the Conception*; (107v-163r) Pseudo Augustine, *Liber soliloquiorum*; (163v-168v) *Excerpta* from Jerome, Bernard, Maximus, Augustine and Cyril; (i) Alphonsus de Spina, *Fortalitium fidei*.

History: fifteenth century (1450-1500). This manuscript was property of Georges I d'Amboise<sup>40</sup>.

### 3.7. Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek. MS 4043 (ff. 108r-145v)

This manuscript is very briefly described in Gerold<sup>41</sup>; the modern catalogue Reinhardt, Santiago-Otero<sup>42</sup> mentions Wien, BN lat. 4045 (Univ. 557), ff. 108r-145v which should be this *excerptum*. The catalogue Thomas, *et al.*<sup>43</sup> has Vienna, Austrian National Library, 4045, probably referring to this *excerptum* too. It is a collection of sermons with abundant annotations. The *Fortalitium fidei's excerptum* corresponds to a paraphrastic transcription of the whole book, with large content gaps.

Material description: paper; 168 ff.; 215 mm x 145 mm; 1 column; irregular lines (37-51); gothic cursive. There are neither big decorated initials nor illuminations.

---

<sup>39</sup> The addition of text to the fly-leaves at the beginning and the end, undoubtedly, goes back to a different hand than the one of the body of the manuscript. It seems to be a later addition. For this reason, its origin and the motivation to incorporate it into this *corpus* cannot really be identified.

<sup>40</sup> This *excerptum* of the *Fortalitium fidei* seems to have been incorporated by another hand at the end of the book. Undoubtedly, it is a rather particular manuscript copy and its origins are difficult to trace. In fact, this *excerptum* could come from the Burgundian or French tradition, although it most likely comes from later editions.

<sup>41</sup> This catalogue only describes the chronology as well as title and foliation of each *excerptum* that conforms the manuscript. See: Gerold 1869, p. 147.

<sup>42</sup> Reinhardt, Santiago-Otero 1986, p. 63.

<sup>43</sup> Thomas, *et al.* 2013, p. 454.

This manuscript was classified as *Theologische Sammelhandschrift*. It contains: (2r-107r) *Collectanea theologica uaria*; (107v) Thomas Ebendorfer de Haselbach, *Sermones*; (108r-145v) Alonsus de Espina, *Fortalitium fidei*; (146r-152v) *Sermones in laudem Beatae Mariae Virginis*; (153r) Paulus de Venetiis, *Tractatus de conceptione Beatae Mariae Virginis*; (157v) *Sermo de S. Johanne Baptista in fine mutilus*. It also contains the *Bullam Johannis XX* (in the front cover) and a list of popes from Innocent III to Urban II (back cover).

History: fifteenth century. This manuscript formerly belonged to the Old University Library of Vienna<sup>44</sup>.

### 3.8. Wrocław, Biblioteka Uniwersytecka. MS I Q 73 a (ff. 124r-146v)

This manuscript is described in detail in Göber, Klapper, 1939<sup>45</sup>; potentially, the incorporation of the *Fortalitium fidei* to this manuscript *corpus* can be linked to an oratorical context of Christian worship; more specifically, it is a *compendium* of homiletic texts. The *excerptum* of the *Fortalitium fidei* corresponds to a paraphrastic transcription of a part of the third book *De bello Iudeorum*. The compiler seems to have had a special interest in the seventh consideration, in which the cruelty of the Jews is described.

Material description: paper; 167 ff.; 210 mm x 160 mm; 1 column; irregular lines (30-39); gothic. There are neither big decorated initials nor illuminations.

This manuscript contains: (1r-30v): Petrus Aureolus, *Tractatus de conceptione Beatae Virginis Mariae*; (31r-34r) Petrus de Verbesia, *Declaratio sententiae beati Bernardi*; (34r-36v) Sixtus IV, *Bulla Grave nimis on the Immaculate Conception*; (37r-46r) *Sermones de tempore et de sanctis*; (46v-75r) Nicolaus Lackman, *De fraternitate*; (75v-123v) *Exemplum de Annuntiatione Domini*; (124r-146v) Alphonsus de Spina, *Fortaliticium fidei*; (147r-v) blank; (148-167v) *Tractatus de timore Dei*.

History: fifteenth century. This manuscript formerly belonged to the Universitätsbibliothek Viadrina (Frankfurt Oder).

---

<sup>44</sup> Due to its proximity, it is likely that this *excerptum* was copied from the Strasburg, Basel or Nürnberg editions of the *Fortalitium fidei*. Even so, there is no explicit information concerning the origins of this manuscript.

<sup>45</sup> The description of this manuscript includes material, foliation, dimensions, chronology and detailed explanation of each *excerptum*. See: Göber, Klapper 1939, pp. 120-121.

### 3.9. Würzburg, Universitätsbibliothek MS M.ch.q.156 (ff. 65r-68r)

This manuscript is described in detail in Thurn<sup>46</sup>; its *corpus* is mostly a set of hagiographic texts. The *Fortalitiium fidei*'s *excerptum* corresponds to a paraphrastic transcription of a part of the fourth book *De bello Sarracenorum*, more precisely, the 156<sup>th</sup> battle of the ninth consideration.

Material description: paper; 326 ff.; 218 mm x 157 mm; 1 column; irregular lines (27-29); gothic. There are neither big decorated initials nor illuminations.

This manuscript is titled *Vitae sanctorum*. It contains: (1r) *Nota*; (2r-4v) *Compendiosa descriptio Dominice passionis*; (5r-v) *Hore de compassione Beate Virginis*; (6r-13v) *Vita gloriose uirginis Marie*; (14r-19r) Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita, *Epistula ad Thymotheum de morte apostolorum Petri et Pauli*; (19v-25v) *Sermo in laudem S. Ambrosii*; (26r-43r) Paulinus Episcopus Nolensis, *Vita Ambrosii*; (43r-v) *Nota*; (43v-45v) *De sancto Paulino Nolensi episcopo ex <Vincentii Bellovacensis> Speculo Hystoriali*; (46r-48v) pages belonging to 189v; (49r-57v) originally blank pages; (58r-64v) *Sermo pulcherrimus de Sancto Ivone Confessore*; (65r-68r) *Fortalitiium fidei*; (68v-69v) blank; (70r-118v) Walafrius abbas Augensis, *Vita sancti Galli confessoris*; (119r-152r) *Vita sancte Haudelaugae virginis*; (152r-v) *Nota*; (152v-153v) *Vita Hadelogae*; (153v-154v) Beda Venerabilis, *De historia ecclesie gentis Anglorum*; (155r-170v) *Vita sancti Albani*; (171r-172r) *Text from martyriologies on Alban*; (172v) blank; (173r-181v) *Vita sancti Bonifacii episcopi et martiris*; (181v-181v) blank; (182r-v) *Vita sancti Lulli episcopi Maguntinensis*; (183r-184v) *De miraculis sancti Auree, episcopi Maguntinensis*; (185r-187v) Pseudo-Ambrosius, *Epistula de uita sanctorum maritum Geruasii et Prothasii*; (187v-189v) Ambrosius, *Epistula 77*; (189v-191r) Augustinus, *Confessiones*; (191v-193v) Pseudo-Ambrosius, *Sermo de sanctis Agricola et Vitale*; (193v-216v) Othloh, *Vita et conversacio sancti Wolffgangi episcopi Ratisponensis*; (216v) *Nota*; (217r-229v) Wolfherius, *Vita sancti Gothardi episcopi Hyldessheimensis*; (230r-252v) Hieronymus, *Vita sancte Paule*; (253r-v) blank; (254r-260v) *Vita beati Maurilii Andegauensis episcopi*; (261r-269v) *Vita Ignatii*; (270r-271r) Ignatius, *Epistule*; (271r-v) *Exemplum*; (272r) *Versus de Beata Virgine Maria*; (272v) *De conceptione uel natiuitate Beate Virginis*; (273r-v) *Deuota collocucio piissime uirginis Marie cum dominica cruce*; (274r-v) *Nota*; (275r-v) *Versus de Sancta Katherina pulchri*; (275v) *Nota*; (276r-v) Oracio Hildeberti episcopi Cenomanensis; (277r-v) *De duodecim sibillis*; (278r-v) *Ex libro duodecim patriarcharum*; (279r-297v) Guilelmus Caoursinus, *Obsidione rhodiae urbis descriptio anno 1480*; (298r-

<sup>46</sup> This catalogue describes material, foliation, dimensions, origin, chronology and detailed description of each *excerptum*. See: Thurn 1990, pp. 165-171.

300r) *Epistole regis Turcorum*; (300v) blank; (301r-311v) Eusebius, *Historia ecclesiastica*; (312r-313r) Augustinus, *Confessiones*; (313v-314r) Eusebius, *Historia ecclesiastica*; (314r-315r) *Ex uita beate Elizabeth*; (315v) *Nota*; (316r-v) blank; (317r-318r) *Ex Iohanne Boccacii*; (118v-320v) *Nota*; (321r-331v) *Versus de sancto Iohanne euangelista*; (322r-323v) blank; (324r-325r) *De sancto Hermigildo rege et martire*; (325v-326v) blank.

History: fifteenth century (1480). This manuscript was property of the Prince-Bishopric of Würzburg.

#### 4. A LIST OF THE LOST LATIN MANUSCRIPTS OF THE *FORTALITIUM FIDEI*

Six further Latin manuscripts of the *Fortalitium fidei* have been mentioned, although they cannot be traced:

- El Escorial, Real Biblioteca de San Lorenzo del Escorial MS I. E. 18: this codex appears in the catalogue Reinhardt, Santiago-Otero 1986, p. 63. Previously, it was mentioned in Antolín 1923, p. 336; it seems that it disappeared during the Napoleonic looting.
- Magdeburg, Ökumenisches Domgymnasium Magdeburg MS 228: this manuscript is referenced in the catalogues Reinhardt, Santiago-Otero 1986, p. 63, and Thomas, *et al.* 2013, p. 454. There is a note in Kinderling 1774, p. 98. The manuscript may have disappeared during the Second World War and was probably taken to the Soviet Union.
- Pontigny, Abbaye Cistercienne de Pontigny MS 155: the manuscript Pontigny is listed in Peyrafort-Huin, *et al.* 2001, p. 411.
- A manuscript from Ghent without shelfmark: the Ghent manuscript, presumably prepared by Aelbrecht Loems and Robbrecht Dierhout, is referenced in Dhanes 1969, p. 370.
- A manuscript from Rooklooster without shelfmark: a manuscript existed in Rooklooster (Oudergem) whose reference is found in Wien, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Cod. Ser. n. 12694 (f. 29v).
- A manuscript from Valladolid without shelfmark: the existence of a manuscript in Valladolid is reported in De Morales 1765, p. 22, who indicates that Fernando de Lunar, Secretary of the Holy Church of Toledo, took some books from Valladolid (among which a *Fortalitium fidei* manuscript) and did not return them.

5. SOME OBSERVATIONS ON THE TRANSMISSION OF THE *FORTALITIUM FIDEI*

## 5.1. The two branches of the textual tradition

While Alfonso de Espina's treatise pursued a very defined objective within its Castilian context, namely to serve as a manual for preachers in the context of anti-Jewish and anti-Islamic polemics, the production of the preserved *Fortalitium fidei* manuscripts outside the Iberian territory seems to respond to a different situation: the witch-hunt in the duchy of Burgundy and the kingdom of France<sup>47</sup>.

Due to the arrangement of the text in the codices, it may be surmised that there were, at least, two potential manuscript traditions in Europe. There is one group of manuscripts (Bruxelles MS 7497; Bruxelles MS II 83; El Burgo de Osma MS 154; Saint-Omer MS 144) that share the same structural characteristics. As our description shows, this group incorporates the *tabula* at the beginning of the treatise and commits a remarkable error in the *incipit* of the fourth book *De Bello Sarracenorum*. These features contrast with another tradition (Bruxelles MS 156-157; Bruxelles MS 9524), whose manuscripts have the *tabula* at the end and the correct *incipit* at the beginning of the fourth book.

Thus, at least two manuscript traditions of the *Fortalitium fidei* seem to have circulated simultaneously in Europe. Most likely, formal differences between manuscripts of the *Fortalitium fidei* already existed in the production of codices in the Castilian territory, but their transmission to the rest of Europe certainly increased the divergences. This may help to understand why there were at least two competing traditions in the Burgundian territory in such close codices (on the one hand, Bruxelles MS 7497 and Bruxelles MS II 83;

---

<sup>47</sup> Although the bull of Pope Innocent VIII *Summis desiderantes affectibus* (1484) or the publication of Heinrich Kramer and Jacob Sprenger's *Malleus maleficarum* (1486) meant a turning point for the witch-hunt in Europe, many books against witches already existed in the heart of Europe in the fifteenth century, such as Johannes Nider's *Formicarius* (1435) or Nicholas Jacquier's *Flagellum haereticorum fascinariorum* (1458). The *Fortalitium fidei* played an equally important role in this matter. Specifically, through the fifteenth century, reactivating the old policies of Philip the Fair of France, a scholastic movement grew out of intellectual and moral theorists against witchcraft and magical arts. Alfonso de Espina's *Fortalitium fidei* was printed and read as one of the first demonological books in Europe. Political reforms against this type of heresy and sects culminated when Innocent VIII repealed the sceptical values of the *Canon Episcopi* in 1484. For this reason, over centuries, the persecution and political trials against witch craze were promoted by the medieval Inquisition, especially in the Flemish territory and in the Kingdom of France. Some of the most notable cases were: Valais (1428), Lyon (1437-39) or Arras (1460), among many others. Cf. Ostorero 2017, pp. 61-83; Ben-Yehuda 1980, pp. 1-31; Audisio 1999, pp. 60-86; Cameron 1984, pp. 7-24; Echevarría 2021, p. 164.

and on the other hand, Bruxelles MS 156-157 and Bruxelles MS 9524). It therefore seems reasonable to assume that there was more than one Castilian manuscript in circulation in Europe, lost at present<sup>48</sup>.

While these characteristics seem to divide the manuscript traditions into two groups, there are some puzzling aspects that reveal multiple connections between codices, which are not easy to explain. I am referring specifically to: the *lacunae* in the sixth consideration of the third book *De bello Iudeorum*; and the *lacunae* in the tenth consideration, also of the third book *De bello Iudeorum*.

## 5.2. Further connections between the manuscripts

### 5.2.1. *The sixth consideration of De bello Iudeorum*

At the end of the manuscript Bruxelles MS 9524 there are a few folios that belong to the sixth consideration of *De bello Iudeorum*. This final addition supplies the text of a *lacuna* that occurs in the codex, namely a gap or omission between the fifth *impossible* and the tenth *impossible* of the third book. At this place in the third book, the copyist left a relatively small blank space, which was noticed by a corrector, whose hand points out the blank space with an *obelus* and indicates *in margine* that the missing text will be provided at the end of the manuscript.

Two observations emerge from this. First, the exemplar used by the copyist of this manuscript may have been of poor quality requiring a revision in the making of the new codex, which was added by a second hand. Second, this revision was probably conducted with the help of another manuscript, so that Bruxelles MS 9524 should be considered a contaminated manuscript.

### 5.2.2. *The tenth consideration of De bello Iudeorum*

The four manuscripts circulating in the Burgundian territory (Bruxelles MS 156-157; Bruxelles MS 9524, Bruxelles MS 7497 and Bruxelles MS II 83) share some differences with regard to the order of the arguments of the tenth consideration of the third book. Specifically, this problem refers to two

---

<sup>48</sup> The only existing manuscript produced in Castilian territory is El Burgo de Osma MS 154. Since this codex contains the error in the *incipit* of the fourth book, it is very likely that there were other Castilian manuscripts that did not. For this reason, the manuscripts that do not present the error must be considered part of a different manuscript tradition.



*lacunae*, one in the second, the other in the eleventh *miraculum* of the tenth consideration, which latter also affects the numbering of the *miracula*. While ten *miracula* are described in the Burgundian manuscripts, eleven appear in the Castilian (El Burgo de Osma MS 154) and the French (Saint-Omer MS 144) manuscripts. Although it is possible to conjecture that between the Castilian and the Burgundian manuscripts there must have been a codex (or more than one) that erred with regard to the *lacunae* and the numbering of the *miracula*, that is, omitting the eleventh, the codicological problem is complex. In Bruxelles MS 156-157 and Bruxelles MS II 83 two *lacunae* have occurred simultaneously, creating a somewhat particular problem. These two errors are found, on the one hand, in the second *miraculum* and, on the other, in the eleventh *miraculum*.

Regarding the error in the second *miraculum*, the manuscripts Bruxelles MS II 83 and Bruxelles MS 156-157 continue, after the first *miraculum*, directly with the third *miraculum*, thus omitting the second (and displacing all the *miracula* from their original numbering). Furthermore, both manuscripts solve this copying problem in the same way, that is, by adding the second *miraculum* under the main text at the bottom of the page. Both the first *miraculum* and the second *miraculum* begin with the same sentence, so it would not be surprising if, reading only the first sentence, the copyists thought that it was a repetition and advanced to the third *miraculum*. A related problem can be observed in Saint-Omer MS 144 and Bruxelles MS 9524. In the case of the manuscript Saint-Omer MS 144, one can see how the copyist blends the end of the first *miraculum* together with the one of the second *miraculum*. Fortunately, this error does not end up affecting the entire numbering of the text, because the copyist seems to have realized the error and continued the text after the end of the second *miraculum* with the complete text of the same, thus including the full text of the second *miraculum* before starting the third one<sup>49</sup>. In turn, the copyist of the Bruxelles MS 9524 includes twice a *secundum miraculum*, the first of which is, in fact, the eleventh *miraculum*, while the second is the correct one. However, this situation does not affect the numbering of the other *miracula*, since the text continues with the correct order. In this case, the copyist must have reproduced the text from an exemplar that had all eleven *miracula*. Most likely, this exemplar contained an error concerning the second *miraculum* and also one referring to the eleventh *miraculum*. Presumably, these

---

<sup>49</sup> This situation is somehow particular, since it seems that the copyist is aware of his error but does not correct the text in which he has made a mistake. As it is a luxurious codex, the copyist of the manuscript Saint-Omer MS 144 seems to have had a strong commitment to the *mise au point* of the treatise, and the correction of his error could compromise the appearance of the text.

*miracula* appeared in the exemplar in form of non-specific corrections, that were introduced in wrong order into the main text of Bruxelles MS 9524.

Regarding the error in the numbering of the eleventh *miraculum*, there are some important codicological problems to discuss. First, there is a transmission problem regarding the eleventh *miraculum* and the manuscripts that circulated in Burgundy. Both Bruxelles MS 156-157 and Bruxelles MS 7497 lack the eleventh *miraculum* in the text, but they reproduce it in a note at the very end of the book. Also, both manuscripts are corrected by a second hand; probably this final addition reflects the fact that the exemplar did not include the eleventh *miraculum*, whereas the manuscript used by the correctors did. For this reason, both manuscripts seem to have been contaminated. In contrast, manuscript Bruxelles MS 9524, as explained above, inserts the eleventh *miraculum* in the second position. This information allows us to surmise that the exemplar used for Bruxelles MS 9524 erred both in the second and the eleventh *miraculum* and that Bruxelles MS 9524 reproduced in a somewhat confusing way the corrections applied in the exemplar. The only extant manuscript that seems to match these characteristics is Bruxelles MS 156-157, which coincidentally contains the same formal characteristics regarding the placement of the tabula and the *incipit* of the fourth book. Although the question remains whether Bruxelles MS 9524 is a copy of Bruxelles MS 156-157, there seems to be some relationship between the two manuscripts. Finally, the only extant manuscript that does neither reproduce nor correct the eleventh *miraculum* is Bruxelles MS II 83. This codex could have caused certain problems in the copying of other manuscripts (in case it served as an exemplar). In general, the problems concerning the eleventh *miraculum* may be explained if we keep in mind that its description is the final part of the tenth consideration of the third book. For this reason, it is possible to hypothesize that some copyists confused the beginning of the eleventh consideration with the end of the eleventh *miraculum*, thus forgetting to copy the *miraculum*.

Although these formal errors provide some relevant information for the reconstruction of the textual tradition of the Latin manuscripts of the *Fortalitium fidei*, it is necessary to collate the text of all extant manuscripts to confirm the above hypotheses and reconstruct a solid *stemma codicum*.

## 6. PRELIMINARY CONCLUSIONS

These new data on the Latin manuscript production of the *Fortalitium fidei* allow us to better understand the transmission of Alfonso de Espina's work and its strong impact on premodern society. While catalogues and academic studies on the subject had identified only a few manuscripts of

the work, the present paper offers the first reliable handlist, with description and analysis of 21 Latin manuscripts of the *Fortalitium fidei*. Our analysis suggests the following, though further evidence needs to be gathered. Firstly, the production of Latin manuscripts of the *Fortalitium fidei* within the Iberian territory was probably larger than is known from the extant manuscripts; secondly, its circulation had, above all, a great impact in Burgundy, France and the Empire; and thirdly, the dissemination of the *excerpta* of this treatise seems to be closely related to its print production. Regarding the Burgundian manuscripts, it seems that they were key texts for the campaign against witchcraft. Moreover, the Saint-Omer manuscript allows us to link the Latin tradition with the French translation.

While one will have to wait for the critical edition of the text in order to establish the exact relations between these manuscripts, our new data indicate that the *Fortalitium fidei* was a highly reputed and widely read book that offered a privileged approach to religious polemic in pre-modern society and aroused new passions to defend the fortress of the Christian faith.

## 7. CITED BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Antolín, Guillermo (1923), *Catálogo de los códices latinos de la Real Biblioteca de El Escorial*, vol. V, Madrid, Imprenta Helénica.
- Audisio, Gabriel (1999), *The Waldensian Dissent: Persecution and Survival, c. 1170 - c. 1570*, Cambridge, University Press.
- Ben-Yehuda, Nachman (1980), *The European Witch Craze of the 14<sup>th</sup> to 17<sup>th</sup> Centuries: A Sociologist's Perspective*, "American Journal of Sociology" 86/1, pp. 1-31.
- Brugmans, Hajo (1898), *Catalogus codicum manuscritorum Universitatis Groninganae bibliothecae*, Groningae, J. B. Wolters.
- Cameron, Euen (1984), *The Reformation of the Heretics: The Waldenses of the Alps 1480-1580*, Oxford, Clarendon Press.
- Cavallero, Constanza (2018), *Alonso de Espina y sus homónimos: confusiones historiográficas e interrogantes históricos*, "Revista de Historia Jerónimo Zurita" 93, pp. 121-138.
- Coppens, Chris (2010), *The Incunabula of Parc Abbey (Heverlee, Leuven)*, "De Gulden Passer" 88/2, pp. 23-70.
- Dhanes, Elisabeth (1969), *Le scriptorium des Hiéronymites à Gand*, "Scriptorium" 23/2, pp. 361-379.
- Dutschke, Consuelo W. (1989), *Guide to medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts in the Huntington Library*, San Marino (CA), The Library.

- Echevarría, Ana (2021), *The Perception of the Religious Other in Alonso de Espina's Fortalitium fidei: A Tool for Inquisitors?*, in Davis-Secord, Sarah; Vicens, Belen; Vose, Robin (eds.), *Interfaith Relationships and Perceptions of the Other in the Medieval Mediterranean. Mediterranean Perspectives*, London, Palgrave Macmillan Cham, pp. 161-195.
- Falk, Brooke (2017), *Assaults on the Faith: Imagining Jews and Creating Christians in the Late Middle Ages*, New Jersey, University of New Jersey (PhD thesis).
- Fifield, Merle (1972), *The French Manuscripts of Forteresse de la Foy*, "Manuscripta" 16/ 2, pp. 98-111.
- Gerold, Carol (1869), *Tabulae codicum manu scriptorum praeter graecos et orientales in Bibliotheca Palatina Vindobonensi asservatorum*, vol. III (Cod. 3501-5000), Wien, Caroli Geroldi filius.
- Göber, Willi; Klapper, Joseph (1939), *Die Handschriften der Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek Breslau*, Leipzig, Harrassowitz.
- Halm, Karl; Meyer, Wilhelm (1969), *Catalogus Codicum Latinorum Bibliothecae Regiae Monacensis*, vol. II-4, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz.
- Hulin de Loo, Georges; Larneere, Auguste; Vander Linden, Herman; Nolf, Pierre; Pelsenceer, Paul; Swarts, Frédéric; Dahalu, Marcel; Cornil, Goerges; Cuvelier, Joseph; Roersch, Alphonse; De Reul, Paul; Brunfaut, Jules; Vreuls, Victor; Solvay, Lucien; Van Zype, Gustave (1938), *Biographie Nationale, Waasberghe-Zypaeus*, vol. XXVII, Bruxelles, Bruylant.
- Kinderling, Johann Friedrich August (1774), *De Bibliotheca Coenobii Bergensis Narratio Historico Litteraria*, Magdeburg, Seidel et Schendhaver.
- Knaus, Hermann; Staub, Kurt Hans (1979), *Bibelhandschriften / beschrieben von Kurt Hans Staub. Ältere theologische Texte / beschrieben von Hermann Knaus*, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz.
- Kren, Thomas; McKendrick, Scot (2003), *Illuminating the Renaissance: The Triumph of Flemish Manuscript Painting in Europe*, Los Angeles, Getty Publications.
- Martín Abad, Julián (2003), *La edición española fuera de España*, en Infantes de Miguel, Víctor; Lopez, François; Botrel, Jean-François (dirs.), *Historia de la edición y de la lectura en España: 1472-1914*, Madrid, Fundación Germán Sánchez Ruipérez, pp. 105-113.
- Matteoni, Francesca (2008), *The Jew, the Blood and the Body in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe*, "Folklore" 119/ 2, pp. 182-200.
- McMichael, Steven (1994), *Was Jesus of Nazareth the Messiah? Alphonso de Espina's Argument against the Jews Based on His Commentary of*

- the Book of Isaiah in the Fortalitium fidei* (c. 1464), Atlanta, Scholars Press (South Florida Studies in the History of Judaism; 96).
- Meyuhás Ginio, Alisa (1994), *Rêves de croisade contre les Sarrasins dans la Castille du XV<sup>e</sup> siècle. Alonso de Espina, Fortalitium Fidei*, "Revue de l'histoire des religions" 212, pp. 145-174.
- Michelant, Henri (1861), *Manuscrits de la bibliothèque d'agglomération de Saint-Omer. Catalogue général des manuscrits des bibliothèques publiques de France*, vol. III, Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale de France.
- Monsalvo Antón, José M.<sup>a</sup> (2020), *Discursos antijudíos y cuestión conversa: del frente cultural al frente emocional en la Castilla del siglo XV*, "eHumanista/Conversos" 8, pp. 225-244.
- Morales, Ambrosio de (1765), *Viaje de Ambrosio de Morales por orden del Rey D. Felipe II. A los reynos de Leon, y Galicia, y Principado de Asturias*, Madrid, Antonio Marín.
- Netanyahu, Benzion (1976), *Alonso de Espina: Was He a New Christian?*, "Proceedings of the American Academy of Jewish Research" 43, pp. 107-165.
- Ostorero, Martine (2017), *Comment communiquer et diffuser le crime de sorcellerie et le sabbat au XV<sup>e</sup> siècle? L'exemple des Errores gazariorum et du Flagellum hereticorum fascinariorum de Nicolas Jacquier*, in Franz, Gunther; Irsigler, Franz; Voltmer, Rita (eds.), *Hexenwissen. Zum Transfer von Magie- und Zauberei-Imaginationen in interdisziplinärer Perspektive*, Trier, Spee-Verlag, pp. 61-83.
- Peyrafort-Huin, Monique; Stirnemann, Patricia; Benoit, Jean-Pierre (2001), *La bibliothèque médiévale de l'abbaye de Pontigny (XII<sup>e</sup>-XIX<sup>e</sup>). Histoire, inventaire ancien, manuscrits*, Paris, CNRS Éditions (Documents, études et répertoires de l'Institut de Recherche et d'Histoire des Textes; 60).
- Reinhardt, Klaus; Santiago-Otero, Horacio (1986), *Biblioteca bíblica ibérica medieval*, Madrid, CSIC.
- Reyes Gómez, Fermín de los (2005), *Segovia y los orígenes de la imprenta española*, "Revista general de información y documentación" 15/1, pp. 123-148.
- Rojo Orcajo, Timoteo (1929), *Catálogo descriptivo de los códices que se conservan en la Santa Iglesia Catedral de Burgo de Osma*, "Boletín de la Real Academia de la Historia" 95, pp. 152-314.
- Thomas, David; Mallett, Alex; Monferrer Sala, Juan Pedro; Pahlitzsch, Johannes; Swanson, Mark; Teule, Herman; Tolan, John (2013), *Christian-Muslim Relations. A Bibliographical History. Vol. V (1350-1500)*, Leiden - Boston, Brill.

- Thurn, Hans (1990), *Die Handschriften der kleinen Provenienzen und Fragmente. Die mittelniederländischen Codices beschrieb W. Williams-Krapp*, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz.
- Trede, Juliane; Gehrt, Wolf (2011), *Handschriftenkataloge der Staats- und Stadtbibliothek Augsburg*, vol. VIII, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz.
- Van den Gheyn, Joseph (1903), *Catalogue des manuscrits de la Bibliothèque royale de Belgique. Tome troisième: Théologie*, Bruxelles, Lamertin.
- Vidal Doval, Rosa (2013), *Misera Hispania: Jews and Conversos in Alonso de Espina's Fortalitium fidei*, Oxford, The Society for the Study of Medieval Languages and Literature.
- Wunderle, Elisabeth (1995), *Katalog der lateinischen Handschriften der Bayerischen Staatsbibliothek München. Die Handschriften aus St. Emmeram in Regensburg, Band 1, Clm 14000-14130*, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz.

Fecha de recepción del artículo: mayo 2023

Fecha de aceptación y versión final: octubre 2023